

The joyously exuberant depiction of *aślīlatā* or the bawdy in the poetry of Govardhana and Jayadeva, taken by Knutson to be an example of the entrance of the rustic vernacular in Sena poetry, is already present in works from the classical period such as the *Amaruśataka*. Reportage appears in Daṇḍin's *Daśakumāracarita*. Sharp dichotomies may not be so sharp in other words.

Bihani Sarkar

Oriental Institute, University of Oxford

FRANCESCA ORSINI and KATHERINE BUTLER SCHOFIELD (eds):

Tellings and Texts: Music, Literature and Performance in North India. xix, 543 pp. Cambridge: OpenBook Publishers, 2015. ISBN 978 1 78374 102 1.

doi:10.1017/S0041977X16000392

The essays gathered in this wonderful book cover a wide range of contexts, and yet achieve a cogency through their shared purview; much more than a catch-all, the essays as a whole consistently target the multilayered connections between text and performance. A deeply engaging introduction orchestrates the various themes, and may usefully be read both as a foreword and an afterword. The seventeen essays are divided among four sections, as shown in this summary review.

The first section, "Between texts and practices", begins with Monika Horstmann's discussion of uses of "the example" in Dadupanthi homilies; this fine essay perfectly sets the tone for the three that follow, all of which show the section title to be well chosen. In a far-reaching meditation on the different meanings that "translation" can have in the Indian context, John E. Cort quickly transcends the usual dialectics of translation studies and gives us a rich understanding of the multiple types of textual relationship to be found in the works of the Jain author Banarasidas. Muzaffar Alam's essay on the Persian treatise *Mir'āt al-makhḷūqāt* shows how its author, 'Abd al-Rahman Chishti, brought together "Islamic and Indic accounts of the origins and age of the world". Narrative is again the main theme of Amy Bard's superb ethnographic and textual account of Urdu miracle stories, *mo'jizat*, as told in contemporary Pakistan.

Leading the second section, entitled "Books and performances, books for performance", Christian Lee Novetske contributes an outstanding paper on the orality underlying the written tradition of Marathi *kīrtan*; an examination of performers' notebooks not only reveals how "literacy here is subservient to performance" but also goes well beyond the "here" to illuminate more generally the relationship between orality and literature. Pasha M. Khan's highly perceptive discussion of Qissa narratives focuses on Fakhr al-Zamani's *Ṭirāz al-akhbār* but again reaches beyond this specific focus to a consideration of the meanings and limitations of literary genre *per se*. John Stratton Hawley meditates creatively on the various ways in which the original and composite corpora of Surdas *padas* variously reflect attempts to recreate the Sanskrit *Bhāgavata purāṇa* in a vernacular setting, one in which "performance" – whether actual or imagined – may have moulded the form and content of these lyric poems. The section closes with a riveting analysis by Richard Widdess of a Nepali song genre; he discusses the probable origins of the performance of *dapha* (i.e. *dāphā* – the editors unhelpfully eschew diacritics except in direct textual quotation, and sporadically elsewhere in some of the papers) and shows how the

texts, often only faintly understood by the singers themselves, are ultimately subservient to the (ritual) act of their performance.

The third section, “Written clues about performed texts”, opens with a highly informative and wide-ranging article by Allison Busch in which she bravely seeks “to reconstruct some of the aural landscape of early modern Hindi court culture”, and thence to speculate on the relationship between reading and listening as historical ways of accessing Rīti verse; she maintains that such literary features as alliteration can only be “realised” in performance – an assumption that perhaps undervalues the reader’s mind as a stage for silent, inner appreciation and enjoyment. Sunil Sharma does some most effective archival sleuthing in his pursuit of “the acts and lives of performers in Mughal Persian texts”; the result is a brilliant panorama of oral performance in the Mughal milieu, as shown by both direct textual reference and illumination from the side. Stefano Pellò complements Sharma’s paper with a specific focus on the *tazkira* genre, drawing out many inferences about the linguistic and cultural inclusions and exclusions of texts such as Muhammad Afzal Sarkush’s seventeenth-century *Kalimāt al-shu’arā*. Francesca Orsini turns to the “texts and tellings” of *kathā* in the works of poets such as Alam and Isardas, building quite masterfully on Philip Lutgendorf’s pathbreaking expositions of Rāmāyaṇa *kathā*. Imre Bangha concludes this section with a delightfully articulate paper on the various genres of the poet Bajid, who finds at last a worthy champion here; together, Bajid and Bangha give us many a moment of sheer delight.

The final section of the book is on “Musical knowledge and aesthetics” and opens with Allyn Miner’s engaging consideration of “Raga in the early sixteenth century” – the time of Qutban’s *Mirigāvatī*, whose musical references trigger a discussion of both musical and extra-musical meanings of rāga, especially in *rāgamālā* paintings and *rāgadhyanā* texts. Katherine Butler Schofield offers a learned but accessible discussion on the mutual transference, between Hindu and Muslim (especially Sufi) idiom, of the meanings of love; she artfully shows how the aesthetic figure of the *rasika* entered into the discourse of musical connoisseurship in the Mughal milieu. A fine paper by Thibaut d’Hubert addresses a regional tradition whose linguistic *mélange*, dubbed “cosmopolitan” in the editors’ introduction, includes both Persianate and Sanskritic elements: his subject is the seventeenth-century poet Alaol (famously the author of a Bengali version of the *Padmāvat* tale), with a focus on his inherently performative *pāñcālī* narratives. The final, longest, most directly “musical” and (for this reviewer) most engaging paper is Richard K. Wolf’s innovative study of the connections between drumming and text in the Nizami and other related traditions of Islam; the detailed analyses offered here are linked to recordings on the author’s website.

This outstandingly rewarding collection of essays is followed by a brief glossary (which might usefully have helped with the matter of diacritically marked spellings), a consolidated bibliography, and an index. The editors are to be congratulated for pulling together such a coherent array of authors and subjects; and the publishers are to be thanked for making the entire book available *gratis* to all comers through the cornucopia of their website.

Rupert Snell

University of Texas at Austin